

UUCA Capital Facilities Assessment March 2020

UUCA Capital Assets Task Force—John Bates (Chair), Jerry McLellan, Bob Roepnack, Clyde Hardin, Linda Topp (Lead for Executive)

There is no annual operational budget line for replacement of UUCA capital replacement or improvement of UUCA facilities. This leaves UUCA open to long-term increased cost, a continuous “whack-a-mole” approach to fixing facilities, as well as potential safety concerns. To address these concerns, the UUCA Executive and Director of Administration included in their work plans for the 2019–2020 Church year the following:

“We will assemble a task force that will produce a report outlining the state of each of our building’s projected costs to keep them well-maintained and provide at least two possible ideas for funding it.”

John Bates volunteered to lead the task force and, in consultation with the Director of Administration, decided to pursue a two-step approach: 1) collect and inventory UUCA campus building needs with a 10-year projection for when those needs should be addressed, and 2) provide at least two possible ideas for funding. Item #1 has been completed and item #2 is being pursued. Related, but not explicit under item #2, is an implied assessment of current facilities and how they might be best optimized for UUCA use as large capital expenses are due. That is, a follow-on to item #2 should be an analysis of alternatives for UUCA capital spending.

1. Collect and Inventory UUCA Campus Building Needs

An initial list of UUCA capital assets was compiled from 1) UUCA capital depreciation annual list from the UUCA bookkeeper, 2) items from the Welcome project listing, and 3) a capital assets ‘wish list’ kept by the Director of Administration. Once compiled, this master list was found to contain multiple entries for some items, missing items (e.g., office computers, etc.), and conflicting terminology for similar or same items. It took several iterations and discussions with building managers to resolve these differences and get to an agreed list. Also, we endeavored to find dates that capital assets were last renewed, dates when they would need to be replaced, and an inflation rate to estimate time and cost of next replacement. This is a typical approach to managing capital assets and works best with mechanical and electrical assets and those in the Sanctuary, main office space, and Sandburg Hall.

In order to validate this capital asset list, and identify additional items needing attention, a group of those knowledgeable about the buildings (John Bates, Bob Roepnack, Clyde Hardin, and Linda Topp) met to conduct a complete walk-through of all buildings and spaces on 21 November 2019. We were able to further clarify names and locations of assets in all buildings. However, the most important aspect of this walk-through was identifying major, non-recurring capital assets that need near-term attention. These include things like window replacement in both 21 and 23 Edwin Pl., exterior structural needs, and safety and integrity needs.

All of the capital asset needs were then placed into a spreadsheet with a proposed 10-year plan for when these items should be addressed. Details for each of the main properties are listed in Figures 2–4. The overall summary year-by-year for the next 10 years is shown in Figure 1.

Item (Year)	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029	2030	10-year Total
TOTAL Main and SH	\$ 47,920	\$ 12,600	\$ 58,700	\$ 29,000	\$ 52,700	\$ 20,000	\$ 32,200	\$ 1,800	\$ 42,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 296,920
TOTAL 21E	\$ 7,500	\$ 30,000	\$ 15,000	\$ -	\$ 30,000	\$ 60,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 142,500
TOTAL 23E	\$ 43,000	\$ 48,000	\$ 8,000	\$ 30,700	\$ 100,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 229,700
CAMPUS TOTAL TOTALS	\$ 98,420	\$ 90,600	\$ 81,700	\$ 59,700	\$ 182,700	\$ 80,000	\$ 32,200	\$ 1,800	\$ 42,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 669,120

Figure 1. Total estimated UUCA Capital Asset needs from 2020 thru 2030.

There are significant needs, ranging from about \$80,000–\$100,000+ to lower values in out years. Some of the projects can slide later in this 10-year period, and note that these costs are just best-guesstimates. With those caveats, however, it is clear that significant resources are required to maintain and improve UUCA facilities. These numbers also should spark a conversation among UUCA leadership about a long-term campus plan. Residential houses, that is, the 21 and 23 Edwin Pl. properties, should be further assessed for whether and how they might be used for UUCA facilities needs. Detailed line-by-line capital needs for the main building and Sandburg Hall, 21 Edwin Pl., and 23 Edwin Pl. are given in the Figures 2–4.

The capital items can be grouped into several categories. Those that are recurring and on a shorter cycle are the external HVAC units on Sandburg Hall and the roofing on the Sanctuary building. Many other items are past typical end-of-life, like refurbishing the bathrooms and main kitchen, but can limp along a bit further. Still other items are a once-in-a-generation replacement, such as the need to rebuild the enclosed porch on 23 Edwin, and the addition of a 2nd floor fire escape, which would bring an added layer of safety to the building. In summary, after pushing many items past end of normal life, it is time for UUCA to make a major effort to fund the needed capital projects.

2. Potential Funding Options for UUCA Capital Facilities

Ideally, a capital facilities reserve should be built into an annual budget at between 5%–10% per year. Many churches find this difficult to do and UUCA is among them. Recent efforts to support additional professional ministry at UUCA could not be sustained and so it is unlikely that a boost of 10% in the annual budget drive would be supported. In the past, the Director of Administration has been creative in applying funds that have become available through a variety of non-recurring events, for example, in one year using funds that became available due to personnel leaving. At other times, one-time UUCA gifts have been applied to capital needs. This patchwork method is, however, hit or miss and is not sufficient to meet anticipated capital needs over the next decade.

There are several ways to approach funding of the needed capital items. A traditional capital campaign is one. However, that traditional approach is unlikely to garner much enthusiasm without posing it a bit differently. One way could be a “time, talent, and treasure” campaign in which capital items for a specific property or outcome are identified. This would bring a clear focus to the effort for UUCA community participation and would create a branding opportunity like one of the home renovation television shows: “Extreme Makeover: 21 Edwin edition”. The properties of 21 and 23 Edwin Pl. are candidates for such efforts that would have a tight focus and time schedule. Considerable preparation would be needed, but this approach might resonate instead of drawn out multi-year process like the Welcome Project.

At the other end of the spectrum is a general Capital Assets Funding Campaign with the goal of generating sufficient funding, target about \$1 million, to cover the projected needs of UUCA over the next decade. Commitments could take place over several tax years so that those who want to contribute could take advantage of that option.

Regardless of the funding approach UUCA decides to take, UUCA should undertake a study of facilities needs that looks forward 10–25 years. Over the past 25 years, UUCA has conducted two facilities studies: one in 1999 that resulted in a main building addition plan by Mr. Bill Moore (the original architect of the main buildings), and one in 2009 by architects Padgett and Freeman. Neither of these efforts led to a formal capital campaign for funding. However, with the prospect now of large spending needs over the next 10 years, it is important for the congregation to carefully consider the cost of simply maintaining the existing facilities, particularly 21 and 23 Edwin that were designed as single family houses, not as community facilities. This study should take place soon, as the city will be doing work along the ditch at 23 Edwin and that would perhaps be a good time to do needed repairs there.

Review of UUCA Buncombe County Property Records and Asheville Ordinances

The 2019 Buncombe County property records for the UUCA campus are summarized below. All buildings and property are tax-exempt. The Sanctuary, Sandburg Hall, and 21 Edwin are considered one lot of a total of 1.52 acres. Land value is \$1,258,000. Main building is valued at \$2,684,200; the 21 Edwin Pl. property is valued at \$217,300. 23 Edwin Pl. is listed as a separate property of 0.4 acre, with land value of \$117,400 and building value of \$410,200. The total size of UUCA property is thus 1.92 acres with a total value of land and buildings of \$4,687,100. The properties are in the Grove Park subdivision and the Grove Park Historic District (a national historic district), however none of the properties has been identified as historically significant. There is also a local neighborhood association and any plans for development or significant alteration of the UUCA campus should be discussed with them.

The City of Asheville development regulations (adopted 2015) define codes for places of worship. It defines the category and regulations for a small place of worship as seating of less than 300 in a Sanctuary and requires at least 1 acre of land for such. The current size of the UUCA Sanctuary is less than 300-person seating, so we do fit in the small category.

Item	COST	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029	2030	0-year Total
Furniture, fixtures, & equip													
MAIN, Sound System	\$ 10,887	\$16,000											
MAIN, Playground	\$ 3,900												
MAIN, blinds - Sanctuary	\$ 4,506												
MAIN, RE storage closet	\$ 1,515												
MAIN, 2 RE Cubicals & Min's Office Build	\$ 3,893												
MAIN, Phone/Internet System Install	\$ 664												
MAIN, New Telephony system required	\$ 15,000			\$15,000									
MAIN, Garbage Disposal (K)	\$ 524	\$ 600											
MAIN, Sanctuary Cabinets	\$ 4,996												
MAIN, Office Foyer Copier	\$ 2,179		\$ 2,400										
MAIN, Sanctuary Fire Alarm Pull Station	\$ 1,015												
MAIN, Upstairs toilet	\$ 902												
MAIN, Surge Protector Building-Wide	\$ 2,754							\$ 3,300					
MAIN, Surge Protector A/V Booth	\$ 1,101							\$ 1,400					
MAIN, Pressure-Reducing Valve	\$ 1,442								\$ 1,800				
MAIN, Champion Dishwasher	\$ 4,979					\$ 5,700							
	\$ 60,256												
Roofing projects													
Main - SH flat roof	\$ 67,776												
Main - Sanctuary roof (needs replacement, ROM)	\$ 43,000			\$43,000									
Main - cedar shake sides refurbish (needs every 2-3)	\$ 5,000	\$ 5,500											
Main - cedar shake sides replacement (WAG)	\$ 12,000	\$12,000											
Main - SH - PV Solar	\$ 87,625												
Main - hot water heater	\$ 600			\$ 700									
SH Projects													
Main - SH deck restrain	\$ 500	\$ 520											
Main - SH replace glass sliders north wall with wall &	\$ 40,000												
Main - SH deck wood replacement	\$ 1,500												
Main - Sandberg hall acoustic panels (replace original)	\$ 4,000				\$ 4,000								
Main - SH carpet replacement (70'x55')	\$ 25,000				\$25,000								
Main - refurbish/update kitchen (wish list WAG)	\$ 47,000					\$47,000							
Main - refurbish/update up women's restroom	\$ 10,000						\$10,000						
Main - refurbish/update up men's restroom	\$ 10,000						\$10,000						
Main - refurbish/update down girl's restroom	\$ 10,000							\$10,000					
Main - refurbish/update down boy's restroom	\$ 10,000							\$10,000					
Main - remodel RE kitchen	\$ 7,500							\$ 7,500					
Sanctuary Projects													
Main - replace Sanctuary carpet & pew upholstery	\$ 30,000									\$42,000			
MAIN HVAC Systems													
Main - HVAC central units--there are a total of 6 AC units	\$ 40,000												
MAIN, HVAC Heat Pump compressor 1 (roof)	\$ 2,863	\$ 3,300											
MAIN, HVAC Heat Pump compressor 2 (roof)		\$ 3,300											
MAIN, HVAC Heat Pump compressor 3 (roof)		\$ 3,300											
MAIN, HVAC Heat Pump compressor 4 (roof)			\$ 3,400										
MAIN, HVAC Heat Pump compressor 5 (roof)			\$ 3,400										
MAIN, HVAC Heat Pump compressor 6 (roof)			\$ 3,400										
MAIN, Heat Pump Air Handler 1 & 2	\$ 9,768												
MAIN, Heat Pump Air Handler 3 (Trane)	\$ 5,636												
MAIN, Heat Pump Air Handler 4													
MAIN, Heat Pump Air Handler-Furnace 5													
Main, Heat Pump Air Handler-Furnace 6													
T-coil	\$ 3,148	\$ 3,400											
Individual Office HVAC Systems													
MAIN, AC unit, Minister	\$ 1,287												
MAIN, AC unit, Admin Asst	\$ 1,154												
Main - HVAC - PTAC units (3) RE #7, FD Min, Gen Adm	\$ 5,875												
MAIN, HVAC - PTAC Unit in Director Admin Office	\$ 1,782												
	\$672,113												
TOTAL Main and SH		\$47,920	\$12,600	\$58,700	\$29,000	\$52,700	\$20,000	\$32,200	\$ 1,800	\$42,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$296,920

Figure 2. Sanctuary and Sandburg Hall Capital Assets. All items and those requiring replacement in 2020–2030 time period.

Item (Year)	Cost	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029	2030	10-year
21E, Furnace	\$ 2,987												
21E, Water Heater	\$ 635												
21E, Dehumidifier	\$ 3,206												
21E - Roof	\$ 10,000			\$10,000									
21E - HVAC - furnace (unclear needed vs item above?)	\$ 10,000												
21E - paint exterior (needs asap)	\$ 7,500	\$ 7,500											
21E - replace windows	\$ 30,000					\$30,000							
21E - Kitchen remodel	\$ 20,000						\$20,000						
21E - HVAC AC and All Windows	\$ 40,000						\$40,000						
21E - Seal and Insulate	\$ 5,000			\$ 5,000									
21E - Structural Integrity & Life (time and materials for needed repairs)	\$ 30,000		\$30,000										
TOTAL	\$ 159,328	\$ 7,500	\$30,000	\$15,000	\$ -	\$30,000	\$60,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 142,500

Figure 3. 21 Edwin Pl. Capital Assets. All items and those requiring replacement in 2020–2030 time period.

Item	COST	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029	2030	10-year Total
23E, Handrail	\$625				\$700								
23E Garage Doors	\$1,200												
23E, Electrical Breaker Box	\$903												
23E, Exterior Sealing	\$1,819												
23E HVAC AC 2	\$5,164												
23E Insulation	\$1,825												
23E HVAC AC 1 replace	\$2,000												
23E Rebuild Enclosed Porch and Add 2nd Floor Fire Exit	\$40,000	\$40,000											
23E HVAC Furnace?	\$3,000			\$3,000									
23E Replace Windows	\$36,000		\$36,000										
23E Water Heater (numbers?)	\$400												
23E Inspect & Replace Wiring	\$2,200												
23E House-wide Fire Alarm System	\$3,000	\$3,000											
23E Replace Roof	\$12,000		\$12,000										
23E Inspect Foundation & Repair (With AVL Sewer project)	\$5,000			\$5,000									
23E Renovate Kitchen	\$30,000				\$30,000								
23E Garage - Elevate pad and replace	\$100,000												
TOTAL	\$245,136	\$43,000	\$48,000	\$8,000	\$30,700	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$129,700

Figure 4. 23 Edwin Pl. Capital Assets. All items and items requiring replacement in 2020–2030 time period.

Useful Capital Assets web sites as of 2019

Is your church ignoring capital needs: <https://www.churchleadership.com/leading-ideas/is-your-church-ignoring-capital-needs/>

The real cost of deferred maintenance: <https://www.facilitiesnet.com/maintenanceoperations/tip/The-Real-Cost-of-Deferred-Maintenance--38366>

Buncombe County Tax Records lookup via address using Full GIS:
<https://www.buncombecounty.org/Governing/Depts/GIS/Default.aspx>

Asheville NC Code of Ordinances:
<https://appsrv.pace.edu/GainingGround//ProgramFiles/ViewResource/newFileDownload.cfm?res=GM347K090717020632>

Version 1.1 of 3/3/2020 John Bates